

1 Alpine garden plants from six continents show high vulnerability to ice
2 encasement

3
4 Icy surfaces impose challenges for northern societies, wildlife and agriculture. However, the
5 impacts of anoxic ground-ice on non-agricultural plants is poorly studied. During the winter
6 of 2009/10, an extreme winter warming event led to thick ground-ice layer development in the
7 World's northernmost botanical garden in the city of Tromsø in sub-Arctic Norway due to
8 much rain on warm days intervening with cold dry days. After ice melt in late spring we
9 undertook an assessment (not part of any monitoring programme) of plant mortality, testing
10 whether certain growth forms, geographical origins, or terrain features were more vulnerable
11 to stress. We found that mortality was negatively correlated with terrain slope, that
12 cryptophytes (plants with resting buds beneath the surface of the ground) were most
13 vulnerable, and that high soil drainage improved survival. Vegetation greenness (NDVI)
14 reached an unprecedented minimum in the summer of 2010 and remained low for two more
15 years. The results suggest that more investigations of the impacts of ground-ice are needed to
16 understand better how alpine ecosystems will change with increasing climate change. This
17 study shows that garden studies may be a valuable supplement to field studies, as plants of
18 different origins can be studied under similar climatic conditions.

19 Keywords: *anoxia, extreme event, NDVI, plant mortality, winter warming*

20

21 **Bjerke, Jarle W.; Elvebakk, Arve; Tømmervik, Hans.**

22 Alpine garden plants from six continents show high vulnerability to ice encasement. *Norsk*
23 *Geografisk Tidsskrift* 2017 DOI: [10.1080/00291951.2017.1391876](https://doi.org/10.1080/00291951.2017.1391876)

24

25 Introduction

26 Ongoing climate change has caused large reductions in the extent and duration of snow cover
27 (Liston & Hiemstra 2011; Walsh et al. 2011). It also affects the properties of the snowpack in
28 regions where snow still is common. Increasing frequency of warm spells in winter cause
29 partial snowmelt, which lead to shallower snowpack, which, upon return to freezing, become
30 compact with one or multiple ice layers (Johansson et al. 2011; Vikhamar-Schuler et al.
31 2016). Ice layers on the ground is a recurrent problem for alpine and Arctic mammals. Large
32 grazers such as reindeer/caribou and muskoxen are not able to dig through a hermetic ice
33 sheet (Forchhammer & Boertmann 1993; Riseth et al. 2011; Hansen et al. 2014). Starvation
34 and population crashes are often the result. Small mammals such as lemming are dependent
35 on air-filled spaces in their subnivean environment (the subnivium); hence, transformation of
36 the basal snow into ice reduces the survival rate (Pauli et al. 2013).

37 The impacts of ground-ice on vegetation is much less known. Most knowledge is from
38 northern agricultural grasslands in Canada, Iceland and Norway. The anoxic conditions under
39 the ice sheet is detrimental to grasses due to toxifying accumulation of carbon dioxide,
40 ethanol and lactic acid in the leaves (Andrews 1996; Höglind et al. 2010).

41 The conditions under an ice sheet are similar to the anoxic conditions during inundation.
42 Hygrophytes survive inundation by transporting oxygen through their aerenchyma, while
43 meadow grasses lack such tissues and are therefore more vulnerable to both inundation and
44 ice encasement (Crawford 1978; Andersen 1986). Furthermore, plants with low respiration
45 rates at cool temperatures have lower rates of accumulation of anoxic metabolites. Northern
46 species or ecotypes tend to have lower rates than southern species or ecotypes and may
47 therefore be more tolerant of ice encasement (Eagles 1967; Andersen 1986; Crawford et al.
48 1994; Höglind et al. 2010). Consequently, it has been proposed that high-Arctic species are

49 the most tolerant plants to ice encasement (Crawford et al. 1994). However, experimental
50 icing show that the Arctic-alpine snowbed forbs *Omalotheca supina* and *Sibbaldia*
51 *procumbens* and the dwarf shrub *Cassiope tetragona* have very low tolerance of ice
52 encasement (Gudleifsson 2009; Milner et al. 2016), while sub-Arctic ecotypes of *Empetrum*
53 *nigrum* and *Vaccinium vitis-idaea* show reduced reproduction and increased electrolyte
54 leakage under certain icing conditions (Preece & Phoenix 2014). Sub-Arctic lichens are
55 intolerant of ice encapsulation at mild subfreezing temperatures (Bjerke 2011), but show no
56 mortality after being encapsulated in ice at temperatures below $-10\text{ }^{\circ}\text{C}$ (Bjerke 2009).
57 Overall, this shows that we are far from understanding the role of ground-ice in regulating
58 primary productivity and ecosystem structure of boreal, alpine and Arctic ecosystems.

59 Winter climate at high northern latitudes will probably change drastically during the
60 next decades (Vikhamar-Schuler et al. 2016). Higher average temperatures and higher
61 frequency of warm spells will have strong impacts on the snowpack (Walsh et. al. 2011; Pauli
62 et al. 2013). In areas without complete snowmelt, ground-ice will become more common and
63 expose plants to a stress type to which they are not selected (Gudleifsson 2009). This will
64 have unknown consequences on plant communities and trophic interactions and should
65 therefore be elucidated in further detail (Bokhorst et al. 2016). In cases where little
66 information is available from experimental studies, observations in the aftermath of real
67 hazardous events may provide much added knowledge (Jentsch et al. 2007; Callaghan et al.
68 2013; Phoenix & Bjerke 2016).

69 We here report on results from such case study. We estimated damage ratios to a wide
70 variety of primarily alpine plant species after an extreme icing event that took place in
71 Tromsø Arctic-Alpine Botanic Garden, the World's northernmost botanical garden, situated
72 in Tromsø, North Norway, during the winter of 2009/10. In the aftermath of damage, we
73 collected data to elucidate which growth forms and landscape features that were most strongly

74 affected, and we studied the vegetation performance of the Garden area in the years before
75 and after the event using remotely-sensed data. The primary objective of this study was to
76 shed light on contrasting vulnerabilities to winter stress related to differences in growth form,
77 geographical origin and microhabitat characters.

78

79 **Materials and Methods**

80 *Observations of an extreme event*

81 An extreme accumulation of ground-ice and soil frost took place in sub-Arctic Norway
82 during the winter of 2009/10, which caused much nuisance to this northern society (Bjerke et
83 al., 2014, 2015). That winter was characterized by large temperature fluctuations involving
84 several freeze-thaw events (Fig. 1). Ten periods of one or several days with daily mean
85 average temperature above 0 °C were recorded during the period from the first freezing event
86 in November to the end of February. The freezing periods were mostly dry, while the thaw
87 periods were associated with much rain; 72 % of the precipitation in January and February fell
88 on days with daily mean temperature above 0 °C (black squares in Fig. 1b). The rain quickly
89 froze during freezing periods, which led to an extreme build-up of ice on the ground (Bjerke
90 et al. 2015). This winter had the lowest temperature sum on snow-free days of all winters
91 between 1998 and 2014, thus the combination of lack of an insulating snow layer and long
92 periods of freezing led to extremely deep soil frost (Bjerke et al. 2015). In the city of Tromsø,
93 soil frost to at least 150 cm depth was reported from a nearby graveyard (Bjerke et al. 2014).
94 Agricultural yields the following growing season were strongly reduced, because large areas
95 of grasslands died from long-term ice encasement, and because spring farming was much
96 delayed due to persistent soil frost (Bjerke et al. 2015).

97

98 *Study area, plant material and mortality assessment*

99 Tromsø Arctic-Alpine Botanic Garden is situated three latitudinal degrees north of the Arctic
100 Circle in the boreal (sub-Arctic) part of Norway (Troms County, North Norway, 69°40' N
101 18°58' E). It opened in 1994 and became the World's northernmost botanic garden (Elvebakk
102 2008). The Arctic and alpine species of the garden are mostly cultivated in hilly rock
103 landscapes on well-drained soils dominated by mineral components between rocks and
104 boulders, but partly also in flat to gently sloping terrains on more organic soils. The species
105 grown in the Garden originate from cold areas from most parts of the world. Plants are partly
106 grown in geographically defined collections, partly defined by plant families. Plant names
107 follow the International Plant Name Index (2016). Weather data presented are from the station
108 Holt in Tromsø (69°39' N 18°54' E), which is located 3.5 km SW at approximately the same
109 altitude (12 m) as the botanic garden. Weather data were retrieved from an online database
110 (NIBIO 2016).

111 During the winter of 2009/10, thick layers of ground-ice also accumulated in the Botanic
112 Garden. Many plantings were recorded as dead shortly after ice melt in late spring. All major
113 plantings affected were assessed for alive-to-dead shoot ratios. In the aftermath of damage, we
114 had a strong focus on comparative analyses of contrasting terrain forms. Plant survival was
115 recorded first in early summer, and again in late summer of 2010, by estimating a percentage-
116 based survival rate. The percentage was based on numbers of individuals surviving, except for
117 two genera (*Filipendula* and *Lilium*) cultivated as large and few individuals. For these, we
118 instead estimated their area recovery relative to their state in 2009, prior to this event.
119 Photographs from 2009 were used for comparison.

120 The plantings were defined as species and cultivars within one taxonomic group, as
121 detailed below, and included either a few large and well-established individuals or a group of
122 30 to 300 individuals, generally comprising a restricted area less than 5 m². All these
123 individuals, or more than 90 % in the case of large groups, had been established in the Garden
124 and survived at least three years prior to the year of study, and surviving individuals also
125 persisted during the three years that followed. In the case of large and long-established
126 individuals, ‘survival’ does not include individuals remaining alive but with more than 90 %
127 mortality of buds or branches.

128 In addition, terrain slope (in degrees), percentage of drainage-promoting mineral soil
129 components and occurrence of convex or concave landforms were recorded. Mean values
130 were recorded for many of these plantings, but only sites homogeneous with regard to soil
131 properties and terrain slope were included. The same taxonomic groups were planted at
132 several places in the Garden, in contrasting microhabitats. This made it possible to compare
133 mortality within taxonomic groups (Table S1).

134 Similar detailed analyses of mortality rates are not available for any other years, but
135 unpublished reports and notes from previous curators of the Garden, and our own
136 observations, were used to evaluate the gravity of this event. Data on several species from a
137 genus or a section of a genus were pooled, if their growth forms were identical and if their
138 survival rates were nearly identical. Additional information on plantings and their origins is
139 provided in the Supporting Information.

140

141 *Statistics*

142 We employed an automatic linear modelling analysis with forward stepwise model
143 selection (SPSS Statistics version 22; IBM Co., Armonk, NY, USA) to explore the variation

144 in mortality rates. This is an effective tool for linear modelling, compared to manual
145 modelling procedures, as it accepts categorical, ordinal and numerical data in a single
146 analysis, and allows for bootstrap aggregating to improve model stability, while at the same
147 time providing multiple optimality statistics, including the Akaike's Information Criterion
148 Corrected (AICC) (Yang 2013). The models are ranked according to accuracy (explanatory
149 power) from 0 to 100 %. Predictors included in the best model are ranked according to their
150 relative importance; i.e. the sum of relative importance of the selected predictors is 1.
151 Parameters used were geographical origin (nominal), growth form (ordinal) according to
152 Raunkiær (1934), leaf type (evergreen, semi-evergreen, herbaceous – ordinal), proportion of
153 well-draining minerals in soil (scale), landscape relief (convex, sloping, flat, flat to slightly
154 concave, concave -ordinal) and average terrain slope (scale). Growth forms included in the
155 analysis were cryptophytes (including geophytes and helophytes), short overwintering shoots
156 (i.e. chamaephytes and hemicryptophytes), and phanerophytes. Only the best model is
157 presented in the Results.

158 Linear and non-linear curve fitting was analysed in Microsoft Excel using the add-on
159 Xlfit ver. 5.3.1.3 (ID Business Solutions Ltd., Guildford, UK). Significance tests were run
160 with SPSS.

161

162 *Vegetation greenness*

163 The Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI) is a radiometric measure of the
164 amount of photosynthetically active radiation (~400 to 700 nm) absorbed by chlorophyll in
165 the green leaves of vegetation and has proven to be a good surrogate for the photosynthetic
166 capacity and hence energy absorption of plant canopies during the growing season (Tucker,
167 1979; Myneni et al., 1995). NDVI is defined as the ratio of the difference of the near-infrared

168 (NIR) and red reflectance (ρ) values, $(\rho\text{NIR} - \rho\text{red})$, divided by the sum of the red and NIR
169 reflectance values $(\rho\text{NIR} + \rho\text{red})$ (Tucker 1979; Myneni et al. 1995). NDVI has shown to be a
170 good proxy for reduced plant condition caused by extreme winter events and ground-icing
171 (Bokhorst et al. 2009; Bjerke et al. 2014, 2015). To test if the observed mortality resulted in
172 reduced primary productivity of the Garden area as a whole in 2010, time series on the
173 satellite-based NDVI were retrieved from the Terra MODIS NDVI data, which is based on the
174 MOD09Q1 250 m 8-d reflectance data product (see methods in Bjerke et al. 2014). This
175 product is available from 2000 onwards. NDVI values were extracted from the Garden area,
176 which covers two MODIS pixels, which also include fragments of urban areas and natural
177 vegetation. We studied the time-integrated NDVI (TI-NDVI), which is an average of NDVI
178 from day of year (DOY) 170 to DOY 193, which means from 19 June to 12 July in non-leap
179 years. We also present early-season NDVI, i.e. for DOY 170-177.

180

181 Results

182 During the winter 2009/10, the hermetic ground-ice was measured to be between 5 and
183 40 cm thick in flat and weakly sloping areas of the Botanic Garden (Fig. 2). The ice started to
184 accumulate in December 2009 and grew thicker until spring melt in May, in some shaded or
185 north-facing areas persisting until June. This ice-accumulation trend was consistent with
186 observations from elsewhere in the region. The thick ice layer shown in Fig. 2 was largely a
187 result of the heavy rain in mid-January; from 9 January to 26 January, 60 mm of precipitation
188 fell on days with mean average temperature above 0 °C (Fig. 1b). This precipitation froze to
189 ice on the intervening cold days. The dieback was much more severe than during any other
190 year in the Garden's history, and plants originating from all parts of the world were affected,
191 including plants proven to be bone-hardy during a long horticultural history in Tromsø.

192 The best model from the automatic linear modelling explains 61.6 % of the variation in
193 mortality and includes four predictors. The most important is terrain slope, which has a
194 relative importance of 0.60. The relative importance of the three additional predictors is 0.21
195 (geographical origin), 0.14 (proportion of well-draining minerals in soil), and 0.05 (Raunkiær
196 growth forms). The model merged origin categories to maximize association with target.
197 Plants from East Asia, Himalaya and New Zealand ('EAHNZ') were merged. Mortality of
198 these plants was the double of the mortality of the other plants in the dataset (70 % \pm 10 S.E.
199 vs. 34 % \pm 6 S.E.; $t = 3.05$, $P = 0.004$).

200 The relationship between terrain slope and mortality of the EAHNZ plants is best
201 explained by a linear correlation (Fig. 3a), while the plants of other origins shows a
202 decreasing concave relationship with terrain slope, i.e. a steep decrease from 0 to 20°, and
203 thereafter levelling out (Fig. 3b).

204 The inclusion of mineral soil component in the best model is related to the EAHNZ
205 plants; for these plants mortality and mineral soil component is inversely correlated (Fig. 3c).
206 The correlation between these two parameters for plants of other origins is insignificant ($r =$
207 0.186, $P = 0.31$; not shown graphically).

208 The last predictor included in the best model was growth form. The inclusion of this
209 predictor in the best model is due to the fact that all EAHNZ plants were cryptophytes
210 (geophytes or helophytes), while plants of other origins also included other growth forms.
211 Mortality of the EAHNZ cryptophytes was nearly the double than the mortality of
212 cryptophytes from other regions (70 % vs. 36 %, $t = 2.71$, $P = 0.011$). Mortality of other
213 growth forms (chamaephytes, hemicryptophytes and phanerophytes) also showed an inversely
214 concave relationship with terrain slope, average mortality was 31 %, and high mortality rates
215 was mostly restricted to weakly sloping terrain (Fig. 3d).

216 Of the 22 parallel recordings of taxa compared between strongly sloping vs. flat or
217 weakly sloping terrain, 19 had much better survival rates in strongly sloping terrain (Table
218 S1). In five of these (*Delosperma basuticum*, *Ephedra* spp., *Primula denticulata*, *Primula*
219 *Sect. Sikkimenses*, and *Ranunculus carsei* and *R. insignis*), the garden populations in flat or
220 almost flat terrains died off completely (Table S1), but had good or complete survival in
221 strongly sloping terrain (*Sikkimenses* primulas: mortality between 0 and 30 %).

222 NDVI of the Garden area reached an unprecedented minimum level during the summer
223 of 2010 (Fig. 4a). TI-NDVI in 2010 was 30.4 % lower than the average for the pre-event
224 years from 2000 to 2009 (0.47 vs. 0.68). TI-NDVI increased in the following years, and after
225 5 years, TI-NDVI was slightly higher than the average of the pre-event years (2015: 0.68).
226 Early-season NDVI shows a similar pattern as TI-NDVI, with the lowest value reached in
227 2010 (Fig. 4b), being 49.7 % lower than the average of the pre-event years (2010: 0.34; 2000-
228 2009: 0.67). Early-season NDVI in 2004 was almost as low as in 2010. However, in contrast
229 to the situation in 2010, NDVI quickly reached near-normal levels in 2004, as seen by the TI-
230 NDVI for that year. Early-season NDVI increased slightly in the two years following the
231 extreme event, but was in these years still well below the average of the pre-event years (Fig.
232 4b). After 2012, early-season NDVI increased considerably, in 2015 reaching a value 8.1 %
233 higher than the pre-event average (2015: 0.72).

234

235 Discussion

236 High mortality rates were largely restricted to flat or gently sloping areas covered in
237 thick ice, while plants in steeper terrain where ice did not accumulate, survived. Hence, this
238 case study shows that the provided alpine plants from all continents are indeed intolerant of
239 ice encasement. This is the first observations of ground-ice effects on a large number of alpine

240 species, and it therefore provides added knowledge to the few previous studies on boreal,
241 alpine and Arctic species (Bjerke 2009, 2011; Gudleifsson 2009; Preece et al. 2012; Preece &
242 Phoenix 2013, 2014; Milner et al. 2016; Bjerke et al. 2017).

243 Except for the Arctic species of *Dryas*, the studied taxa are alpine or subalpine plants.
244 The results are therefore not representative of Arctic plants. Nevertheless, recent observations
245 from High-Arctic tundra plains indicate that *Dryas* in fact are intolerant of long-term ice
246 encasement (Phoenix & Bjerke 2016; Bjerke et al. 2017).

247 The alpine/subalpine plants studied originate from high altitudes at rather low latitudes
248 (30-50°) from North America, South America, Europe, South Africa, Asia and New Zealand.
249 The EAHNZ plants tended to be more intolerant than plants from other regions. However, this
250 may be due to the confounding factor that all EAHNZ plants were cryptophytes. In a planned
251 experimental design, growth forms would be evenly distributed among geographical origins.
252 However, in this unplanned observational study, we could not correct for this skewness. The
253 inclusion of geographical origin can therefore not be taken as an indication that EAHNZ
254 plants in general are more vulnerable to ice encasement than plants of other origins. However,
255 the fact that mortality of EAHNZ cryptophytes was nearly the double of cryptophytes from
256 other regions indicate region-specific differences in tolerance of cryptophytes to ground-ice.

257 The unprecedented low NDVI values in the following growing season clearly suggest
258 that the icing event was highly unusual, supporting available information from previous
259 curators of the garden that mortality of such extent had not occurred previously. The MODIS
260 pixels are slightly larger than the Garden, and therefore also include some natural forest
261 vegetation, which possibly also was set back by the icing event, as the entire region, including
262 an agricultural grassland 3.5 km from the Garden, suffered from ice encasement (Bjerke et al.
263 2015).

264 The relatively low NDVI in 2011 and 2012 suggests that damage was persistent over
265 several seasons. In the Garden, it took some time to replace all the dead plant areas with a
266 new green cover. Overall, the widespread dieback and the multiyear reduction in NDVI
267 indicate that icing events can have large impacts on ecosystem productivity and carbon
268 budget. Other hazardous events during the winter 2011/12 and cool weather during the
269 summer of 2012 may also have contributed to the low NDVI of the 2012 growing season,
270 while the low NDVI of 2004 was probably due to an unusually cool spring and early summer
271 (Turtiainen et al. 2011; Bjerke et al. 2014).

272 Icing damage may be a potential threat to these species in their natural environment, as
273 most or all species are from areas with seasonal freezing. However, they may avoid being
274 encased in ice by growing in sloping terrain where the risk for long-term ice accumulation is
275 minor. Duration of ice exposure may be a factor of major importance. Experimental icing
276 show that acclimated agricultural grasses and clover can sustain some weeks in ice, but
277 survival starts to decrease quite considerably after ca. 7 days (Andersen 1986; Andrews 1996;
278 Gudleifsson 2009). We here report on an extremely long period of ice encasement, lasting
279 from December until May. This is much longer than what most of these alpine species from
280 lower latitudes would experience in their natural environment. However, in the aftermath of
281 this event, it is not possible to assess when mortality started to rise. It might be that most
282 plants died during the first few weeks of ice encasement, like the plants studied
283 experimentally.

284 The lack of reports of winter damage to these plants from their natural environment
285 does not necessarily mean that winter-induced damage does not occur. An important issue
286 raised in recent years is that events occurring in winter are hard to study (Pauli et al. 2013;
287 Bokhorst et al. 2016; Phoenix & Bjerke 2016). The fact that winters are changing more than
288 summers in many parts of the world has led to a stronger focus on potentially stressful events

289 occurring in winter, but ground-based observations of impacts of extreme events on the
290 snowpack are still limited (Bokhorst et al. 2016). Most recent reports are from high northern
291 latitudes (e.g. Bokhorst et al. 2009; Bjerke et al. 2014, 2015, 2017; Phoenix and Bjerke 2016),
292 but the impacts of subantarctic winter climate change has also recently received attention (e.g.
293 Harsch et al. 2014).

294

295 Conclusion

296 Our report here of ice-related dieback to a high number of plants from a wide variety of
297 geographical origins and growth forms is another clear indication that more studies of the
298 impacts of events in winter are needed to understand better how alpine and other cryophilic
299 ecosystems will change with increasing climate change. Furthermore, this study shows that
300 garden studies using plants of different origins can be very useful, as such studies fill a gap
301 between pure laboratory or climate chamber studies and field studies.

302

303 References

304 Andersen, I. L. 1986. Hva er isbrann? *Polarflokken* 10, 143–149.

305 Andrews, C.J. 1996. How do plants survive ice? *Annals of Botany* 78, 529–536.

306 Bjerke, J.W. 2009. Ice encapsulation rather protects than disturbs the freezing lichen. *Plant*
307 *Biology* 11, 227–235.

308 Bjerke, J.W. 2011. Winter climate change: Ice encapsulation at mild subfreezing temperatures
309 kills freeze-tolerant lichens. *Environmental and Experimental Botany* 72, 404–408.

- 310 Bjerke, J.W., Karlsen, S.R., Høgda, K.A., Malnes, E., Jepsen, J.U., Lovibond, S., Vikhamar-
311 Schuler, D. & Tømmervik, H. 2014. Record-low primary productivity and high plant
312 damage in the Nordic Arctic Region in 2012 caused by multiple weather events and pest
313 outbreaks *Environmental Research Letters* 9, 084006.
- 314 Bjerke, J.W., Tømmervik, H., Zielke, M. & Jørgensen, M. 2015. Impacts of snow season on
315 ground-ice accumulation, soil frost and primary productivity in a grassland of sub-
316 Arctic Norway. *Environmental Research Letters* 10, 095007.
- 317 Bjerke, J.W., Treharne, R., Vikhamar-Schuler, D., Karlsen, S.R., Ravolainen, V., Bokhorst,
318 S., Phoenix, G.K., Bochenek, Z. & Tømmervik, H. 2017. Understanding the drivers of
319 extensive plant damage in boreal and Arctic ecosystems: Insights from field surveys in
320 the aftermath of damage. *Science of the Total Environment* 599-600, 1965–1976.
- 321 Bokhorst, S.F., Bjerke, J.W., Tømmervik, H., Callaghan, T.V. & Phoenix, G.K. 2009. Winter
322 warming events damage sub-Arctic vegetation: consistent evidence from an
323 experimental manipulation and a natural event. *Journal of Ecology* 97, 1408–1415.
- 324 Bokhorst S., Pedersen, S.H., Brucker, L., Anisimov O., Bjerke J.W., Brown, R.D., Ehrich, D.,
325 Essery, R.L.H., Heilig, A., Ingvander, S., Johansson, C., Johansson, M., Jónsdóttir, I.S.,
326 Niila, I., Luojus, K., Macelloni, G., Mariash, H., McLennan, D., Rosqvist, G.N., Sato,
327 A., Savela, H., Schneebeil, M., Sokolov, A., Sokratov, S.A., Terzago, S., Vikhamar-
328 Schuler, D., Williamson, S.N., Qiu, Y. & Callaghan, T.V. 2016. Changing Arctic snow
329 cover: a review of recent developments and assessment of future needs for observations,
330 modelling and impacts. *Ambio* 45, 516–537.
- 331 Callaghan, T.V., Jonasson, C., Thierfelder, T., Zhenlin, Y., Hedenås, H., Johansson, M.,
332 Molau, U., van Bogaert, R., Michelsen, A., Olofsson, J., Gwynn-Jones, D., Bokhorst,
333 S., Phoenix, G.K., Bjerke, J.W., Tømmervik, H., Christensen, T.R., Hanna, E., Koller,

- 334 E.K. & Sloan, V.L. 2013. Ecosystem change and stability over multiple decades in the
335 Swedish sub-Arctic: complex processes and multiple drivers. *Philosophical*
336 *Transactions of the Royal Society, B, Biological Sciences* 368, 20120488.
- 337 Crawford, R.M.M. 1978. Biochemical and biological similarities in marsh plants and diving
338 animals. *Naturwissenschaften* 65, 194–201.
- 339 Crawford, R.M.M., Chapman, H.M. & Hodge, H. 1994. Anoxia tolerance in high Arctic
340 vegetation. *Arctic and Alpine Research* 26, 308–312.
- 341 Eagles, C.F. 1967. Apparent photosynthesis and respiration in populations of *Lolium perenne*
342 from contrasting climatic regions. *Nature* 215, 557–560.
- 343 Elvebakk, A. 2008. Tromsø Arctic-Alpine Botanic Garden. *Rock Garden* 120, 40–63.
- 344 Forchhammer, M.C. & Boertmann, D. 1993. The muskoxen *Ovibos moschatus* in north and
345 north-east Greenland: population trends and the influence of abiotic parameters on
346 population dynamics. *Ecography* 16, 299–308.
- 347 Gudleifsson, B.E. 2009. Ice encasement damage on grass crops and alpine plants in Iceland –
348 impact of climate change. Gusta, L., Wisniewski, M. & Tanino, K. (eds.) *Plant Cold*
349 *Hardiness: From the Laboratory to the Field*, 163–172. CABI, Wallingford.
- 350 Hansen, B.B., Isaksen, K., Benestad, R.E., Kohler, J., Pedersen, Å.Ø., Loe, L.E., Coulson, S.
351 J., Larsen, J.O. & Varpe, Ø. 2014. Warmer and wetter winters: characteristics and
352 implications of an extreme weather event in the High Arctic. *Environmental Research*
353 *Letters* 9, 114021.
- 354 Harsch, M.A., McGlone, M.S. & Wilmshurst, J.M. 2014. Winter climate limits Subantarctic
355 low forest growth and establishment. *PLOS One* 9, e93241.

- 356 Höglind, M., Bakken, A.K., Jørgensen, M. & Østrem, L. 2010. Tolerance to frost and ice
357 encasement in cultivars of timothy and perennial ryegrass during winter. *Grass and*
358 *Forage Science* 65, 431–445.
- 359 International Plant Names Index 2015. *Plant Name Query*. Kew, Harvard, Canberra: The
360 International Plant Names Index, [accessed 8 February 2017]. Available from:
361 <http://www.ipni.org/>
- 362 Jentsch, A., Kreyling, J. & Beierkuhnlein, C. 2007. A new generation of climate-change
363 experiments: events, not trends. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment* 5, 365–374.
- 364 Johansson, C., Pohjola, V.A., Jonasson, C. & Callaghan, T.V. 2011. Multi-decadal changes in
365 snow characteristics in sub-Arctic Sweden. *Ambio* 40, 566–574.
- 366 Liston, G.E. & Hiemstra, C.A. 2011. The changing cryosphere: pan-Arctic snow trends
367 (1979-2009). *Journal of Climate* 24, 5691–5712.
- 368 Milner, J.M., Varpe, Ø., van der Wal, R. & Hansen, B.B. 2016. Experimental icing affects
369 growth, mortality, and flowering in a high Arctic dwarf shrub. *Ecology and Evolution* 6,
370 2139–2148.
- 371 Myneni, R.B., Hall, F.G., Sellers, P.J. & Marshak, A.L. 1995. The interpretation of spectral
372 vegetation indexes. *IEEE Transactions on Geoscience and Remote Sensing* 33, 481–
373 486.
- 374 NIBIO 2016. *Landbruksmeteorologisk Tjeneste*. Ås: Norwegian Institute for Bioeconomy
375 [accessed 8 February 2017]. Available from: <http://lmt.bioforsk.no/>
- 376 Pauli, J.N., Zuckerberg, B., Whiteman, J.P. & Porter, W. 2013. The subnivium: a
377 deteriorating seasonal refugium. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment* 11, 260–
378 267.

- 379 Phoenix G.K. & Bjerke, J.W. 2016. Arctic browning: events and trends as drivers. *Global*
380 *Change Biology* 22, 2960–2962.
- 381 Preece, C., Callaghan, T.V. & Phoenix, G.K. 2012. Impacts of winter icing events on the
382 growth, phenology and physiology of sub-Arctic dwarf shrubs. *Physiologia Plantarum*
383 146, 460–472.
- 384 Preece, C. & Phoenix, G.K. 2013. Responses of sub-Arctic dwarf shrubs to low oxygen and
385 high carbon dioxide conditions. *Environmental and Experimental Botany* 85, 7–15.
- 386 Preece C. & Phoenix, G.K. 2014. Impact of early and late winter icing events on sub-Arctic
387 dwarf shrubs. *Plant Biology* 16, 125–132.
- 388 Raunkiær, C. 1934. *The Life Forms of Plants and Statistical Plant Geography, being the*
389 *collected papers of C. Raunkiær*. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- 390 Riseth, J.Å., Tømmervik, H., Helander-Renvall, E., Labba, N., Johansson, C., Malnes, E.,
391 Bjerke, J.W., Jonsson, C., Pohjola, V., Sarri, L.-E., Schanche, A. & Callaghan, T.V.
392 2011. Sámi traditional ecological knowledge as a guide to science: snow, ice and
393 reindeer pasture facing climate change. *Polar Record* 47, 202–217.
- 394 Tucker, C.J. 1979. Red and photographic infrared linear combinations for monitoring
395 vegetation. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 8, 127–150.
- 396 Turtiainen, M., Salo, K. & Saastamoinen, O. 2011. Variations of yield and utilization of
397 bilberries (*Vaccinium myrtillus* L.) and cowberries (*V. vitis-idaea* L.) in Finland. *Silva*
398 *Fennica* 45, 237–251.
- 399 Vikhamar-Schuler, D., Isaksen, K., Haugen, J.E., Tømmervik, H., Luks, B. & Bjerke, J.W.
400 2016. Changes in winter warm events in the Nordic Arctic Region. *Journal of Climate*
401 29, 6223–6244.

- 402 Walsh, J.E., Overland, J.E., Groisman, P.Y. & Rudolf, B. 2011. Arctic climate: recent
403 variations. Symon, C., Thing, H., Pawlak, J. & Larson, T. (eds.) *Snow, Water, Ice and*
404 *Permafrost in the Arctic (SWIPA): Climate Change and the Cryosphere*, chapter 3, 18
405 pp. Arctic Monitoring and Assessment Program, Oslo.
- 406 Yang, W. 2013. The case for being automatic: introducing the automatic linear modeling
407 (LINEAR) procedure in SPSS statistics. *Multiple Linear Regression Viewpoints* 39, 27–
408 37.
- 409

410 Figure captions

411 Fig. 1. Temperature (a) and precipitation (b) measured at the weather station Holt in Tromsø
412 from 1 November 2009 to 1 March 2010. Black squares in (b) represent precipitation above 0
413 mm on days with daily average temperature above 0 °C.

414 Fig. 2. Extreme ground-ice formation. (a) In sloping terrain in the North-Norwegian
415 Traditional Garden Plants and in the Succulent collections. (b) On and below large boulders in
416 the Primulaceae collection. (c). In flat terrain around the pond. The photographs were taken
417 27 January 2010.

418 Fig. 3. Correlation with mortality in various groups of species for terrain slope or mineral soil
419 component. (a) Terrain slope for plants from East Asia, Himalaya and New Zealand
420 (EAHNZ); $r = 0.569$, $P = 0.027$. (b) Terrain slope for plants of other geographical origins; $r =$
421 0.641 , $P = 0.001$. (c) Mineral soil component for EAHNZ plants; $r = 0.532$, $P = 0.041$. (d)
422 Terrain slope for non-cryptophytes (i.e. hemicryptophytes, chamaephytes and phanerophytes);
423 $r = 0.656$, $P = 0.023$. Dashed lines show 95 % confidence intervals.

424 Fig. 4. Vegetation greenness (NDVI) of the garden area. a. Time-integrated NDVI for the
425 growing-season period from day-of year (DOY) 170 to 193 (i.e. 19 June to 12 July in non-
426 leap years). b. Early-season NDVI (DOY 170-177).